**TEMPLATE 3 – OTM-R Checklist**

Case number: 2018NO360548

Name Organisation under review: **Norwegian University of Science and Technology (NTNU), NORWAY**

Organisation’s contact details: Kristin Wergeland Brekke, kristin.brekke@ntnu.no, phone: + 47 93 49 20 89

Submission date: 14 December 2018

Date endorsement Charter and Code: 17 November 2008

**OTM-R Checklist**

A specific self-assessment checklist is provided for Open, Transparent and Merit-Based Recruitment (OTM-R). Please report on the status of achievement, also detail on the indicators and the form of measurement used.

|  |
| --- |
| ***OTM-R checklist for organisations*** |
|  | **Open** | **Trans-parent** | **Merit-based** | **Answer:++ Yes, c*ompletely******+/-Yes, substantially*** ***-/+ Yes, partially******-- No*** | * **Suggested indicators (or form of measurement)**
 |
| **OTM-R system**  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1. Have we published a version of our OTM-R policy online (in the national language and in English)? | x | x | x | *++ Yes, completely* | [Human Resources Policy for NTNU](https://innsida.ntnu.no/wiki/-/wiki/English/Human%2Bresources%2Bpolicy%2Bfor%2BNTNU) adopted by the Board 28 March 2007  |
| 2. Do we have an internal guide setting out clear OTM-R procedures and practices for all types of positions? | x | x | x | *++ Yes, completely* | [Staff Regulations for academic positions](https://innsida.ntnu.no/c/wiki/get_page_attachment?p_l_id=22780&nodeId=24647&title=Personalreglement&fileName=Personalreglement_vitenskapelige_2016_engelsk.pdf) adopted by the Board 2009, last updated 1 March 2016. Staff Regulations have to be adapted to new national legislation by 1 July 2019. Likely to be replaced by shorter regulations supplemented by administrative procedures. Deadline: end of 2019. |
| 3. Is everyone involved in the process sufficiently trained in the area of OTM-R? | x | x | x | *++ Yes, completely* | HR staff at the Faculties provide professional services and leadership support to those involved. The NTNU HR forum and HR newsfeed facilitates competence development and sharing of information across Faculties. The NTNU Management Training Programme (each 4-year term) introduces all Deans and Heads of Departments to the main OTM-R principles. *“Forbedringsprogrammet for vitenskapelig rekruttering” (2018-2019)*: Harmonized procedures are being developed for recruitment to permanent academic positions (2018) and will be developed for temporary positions (2019). The aim is to harmonize quality and speed of recruitment process across Faculties. Training in new procedures will be given to HR staff (e-learning modules are considered).* Average time from application deadline to appointment decision for permanent positions: 2016 - 7 months (variation 3-19 months).
 |
| 4. Do we make (sufficient) use of e-recruitment tools?  | x | x |  | *++ Yes, completely* | NTNU has for years used an online recruitment system, which covers all stages of the process.Development ambitions include harmonization of procedures across Faculties (2018-19) and better integration of the e-systems for recruitment, HR administration, and archive.  |
| 5. Do we have a quality control system for OTM-R in place? | x | x | x | *++ Yes, completely* | HR staff ensures that all cases are treated in conformity with the Staff regulations. OTM-R is embedded in Norwegian legislation to ensure that the best qualified candidate is selected. A to-step process is applied for all academic positions separating the assessment of applicants (Department level) from the appointment decision (Faculty level). * An applicant satisfaction survey is planned from 2019 to obtain systematic feedback from all applicants on the recruitment process.
 |
| 6. Does our current OTM-R policy encourage external candidates to apply? | x | x | x | *++ Yes, completely* | * Trend in the share of applicants from outside the organization (HR)2017: 94 % of applicants to academic positions came from outside NTNU (Source: JobbNorge)
 |
| 7. Is our current OTM-R policy in line with policies to attract researchers from abroad?  | x | x | x | *++ Yes, completely* | * Trend in share of applicants from abroad (HR) 2017: 87 % of applicants to academic positions were non-Norwegian nationals (Source: JobbNorge)
 |
| 8. Is our current OTM-R policy in line with policies to attract underrepresented groups?  | x | x | x | *++ Yes, completely* | NTNU job advertisement templates includes clauses to encourage underrepresented groups to apply. NTNU staff regulations stipulates that if there are qualified applicants with an immigrant background or with a disability, at least one of them shall be invited for an interview. To enable moderate gender quotation, the nomination shall make it clear if the qualifications of applicants are approximately equivalent. * Trend in share of applicants among underrepresented groups (women) (HR)2017: 24 % female applicants to academic positions.
 |
| 9. Is our current OTM-R policy in line with policies to provide attractive working conditions for researchers? | x | x | x | *++ Yes, completely* | NTNU HR Policy underlines that the university shall provide internationally competitive working conditions – academically and socially – in order to attract internationally outstanding researchers and academic staff. NTNU International Researcher Support (Euraxess Service Centre) supports the Departments in their onboarding of international staff. |
| 10. Do we have means to monitor whether the most suitable researchers apply? |  |  |  | *-/+ Partially* | The Department/Research group will normally have an impression of whether they obtained the most suitable applicants on the job market.  |
| **Advertising and application phase** |  |  |  |  |  |
| 11. Do we have clear guidelines or templates (e.g., EURAXESS) for advertising positions?  | x | x |  | *++ Yes, completely* | Guidelines and templates exist and will be revised as part of the harmonization work (2018-2019). HR encourages “programmatic recruitment” selecting the most promising channels for advertisements and actively “searching for candidates” in relevant academic environments. |
| 12. Do we include in the job advertisement references/links to all the elements foreseen in the relevant section of the toolkit?  | x | x |  | *+/- Yes, substantially* | Information on career development opportunities, selection criteria, or relevant policies are not always easy to find in job advertisements and on recruitment websites today. * Possible improvements in guidelines, templates and websites inspired by the OTM-R toolkit, will be part of the harmonization work (2018-2019).
 |
| 13. Do we make full use of EURAXESS to ensure our research vacancies reach a wider audience?  | x | x |  | *+/- Yes, substantially* | Advertisement on Euraxess Jobs is currently optional in the e-recruitment system unless it is an EU mobility grant position. * Advertisements on Euraxess Jobs should become obligatory in the e-recruitment system for all internationally published positions (2018).
* The share of job advertisements posted on EURAXESS (HR). 8 % of the 573 advertisements for academic positions in 2017 was also posted on Euraxess Jobs. Most were PhD and Postdoc posts.
 |
| 14. Do we make use of other job advertising tools? | x | x |  | *++ Yes, completely* | Multiple channels are used among others unijobs, researchgate, LinkedIn, but also selected journals and newspapers such as Nature or Die Zeit.  |
| 15. Do we keep the administrative burden to a minimum for the candidate?  | x |  |  | *++ Yes, completely* | Documentation is limited to what is necessary for the assessment, and can be uploaded on the e-application system. Original documents such as letters of recommendation, can be requested at the interview. Certificates in original language are accepted, but candidates are kindly requested to send a [Diploma Supplement](http://ec.europa.eu/education/resources/diploma-supplement_en) or a similar document describing the study and grade system.  |
| **Selection and evaluation phase** |  |  |  |  |  |
| 16. Do we have clear rules governing the appointment of selection committees? |  | x | x | *++ Yes, completely* | NTNU Staff Regulations for academic positions: The expert committee and if applicable the committee on teaching skills are appointed by the Head of Department. The appointment authority is a subgroup of the Faculty Board. |
| 17. Do we have clear rules concerning the composition of selection committees? |  | x | x | *++ Yes, completely* | NTNU Staff Regulations for academic positions: The expert committee shall have at least three members of which two external and of both gender. The teaching skills committee shall also have at least three members including a student and both gender.  |
| 18. Are the committees sufficiently gender-balanced? |  | x | x | *++ Yes, completely* | NTNU Staff Regulations for academic positions: Both gender must be represented on expert committees, teaching committees and the appointment authority. |
| 19. Do we have clear guidelines for selection committees which help to judge ‘merit’ in a way that leads to the best candidate being selected? |  |  | x | ++ Yes, completely | The required qualifications for various academic positions are defined in the national [Regulations concerning appointment and promotion to teaching and research posts](https://www.regjeringen.no/globalassets/upload/kd/vedlegg/uh/forskrifter/regulation_concerning_appointment_promotion_teaching_research_posts.pdf) (in conformity with Council Directive 89/48 EEC and Directive 2001/19/EC). For specific disciplines, supplementary qualifications guidelines are developed by the Disciplinary Strategic Units of Universities Norway (UHR). NTNU Staff Regulations stipulates that in the total assessment, the expert assessments shall be emphasized, but the assessment of teaching skills, interviews and reference checks may provide basis for changing the ranking or for not nominating an applicant. |
| **Appointment phase** |  |  |  |  |  |
| 20. Do we inform all applicants at the end of the selection process?  |  | x |  | ++ Yes, completely | All applicants are informed about who got the job. |
| 21. Do we provide adequate feedback to interviewees? |  | x |  | ++ Yes, completely | Interviewees get feedback if they ask for it. All applicants receive the list of applicants.Applicants selected for peer assessment, receive the academic assessment reports from the expert committee and the teaching committee.  |
| 22. Do we have an appropriate complaints mechanism in place? |  | x |  | -/+ Yes, substantially | Applicants are given a two week period for comments on the expert committees report (academic judgement and ranking of candidates).With respect to the total assessment and final appointment decision, national legislation does not permit insight into the reasons behind the hiring decision and does not open for complaints on the decision ([Public Administration Act](https://lovdata.no/dokument/NLE/lov/1967-02-10)). However, if an applicant sends a complaint or contacts HR or the Department, the applicant will get appropriate feedback on factual and procedural matters.  |
| **Overall assessment**  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 23. Do we have a system in place to assess whether OTM-R delivers on its objectives? |  |  |  | ++ Yes, completely | The OTM-R objective of appointing the best qualified candidate regardless of nationality or gender, are firmly embedded in the [Norwegian Act relating to universities and university colleges](http://app.uio.no/ub/ujur/oversatte-lover/data/lov-20050401-015-eng.pdf) and [NTNU Staff regulations for academic positions](https://innsida.ntnu.no/c/wiki/get_page_attachment?p_l_id=22780&nodeId=24647&title=Personalreglement&fileName=Personalreglement_vitenskapelige_2016_engelsk.pdf). Firm national and institutional regulations coupled with clear procedures and professional support from HR staff, contributes to high quality in each step of the recruitment process.  |