

TEMPLATE 3 – OTM-R Checklist

Case number: 2018NO360548

Name Organisation under review: **Norwegian University of Science and Technology (NTNU), NORWAY**

Organisation's contact details: Kristin Wergeland Brekke, kristin.brekke@ntnu.no, phone: + 47 93 49 20 89

SUBMISSION DATE: 14 DECEMBER 2018, UPDATED 10 MAY 2022

DATE ENDORSEMENT CHARTER AND CODE: 17 November 2008

OTM-R Checklist

A specific self-assessment checklist is provided for Open, Transparent and Merit-Based Recruitment (OTM-R). Please report on the status of achievement, also detail on the indicators and the form of measurement used.

<i>OTM-R checklist for organisations</i>					
	Open	Trans- parent	Merit- based	Answer: ++ Yes, <i>completely</i> +/-Yes, <i>substantially</i> -/+ Yes, <i>partially</i> -- No	➤ Suggested indicators (or form of measurement)
OTM-R system					
1. Have we published a version of our OTM-R policy online (in the national language and in English)?	x	x	x	++ Yes, <i>completely</i>	<u>Human Resources Policy for NTNU</u> adopted by the Board 28 March 2007. A revised policy is to be adopted in 2022.
2. Do we have an internal guide setting out clear OTM-R procedures and practices for all types of positions?	x	x	x	++ Yes, <i>completely</i>	<u>Regulations and local procedures for academic staff</u> were adopted on 28 May 2021 in an agreement between the working parties.

					The Regulations are supported by harmonized <u>administrative procedures and checklists</u> (in Norwegian only) at each stage of the recruitment process to ensure compliance with the regulations for the recruitment of temporary academic staff and permanent academic staff respectively. These procedures are the result of development work started in 2018 with the aim to harmonize quality and speed in the recruitment process.
3. Is everyone involved in the process sufficiently trained in the area of OTM-R?	x	x	x	<i>++ Yes, completely</i>	<p>The NTNU Management Training Programme (each 4-year term) introduces all Deans and Heads of Departments to the main OTM-R principles.</p> <p>HR staff at the Faculties provides professional services and leadership support to those involved.</p> <p>The NTNU HR Recruitment Network and HR newsfeed facilitate competence development and sharing of information across Faculties. They have also set up routines for the further development of NTNU procedures. Training in new procedures is given by HR staff (e-learning modules are considered).</p> <p>➤ Average time from the application deadline to appointment decision for permanent positions for permanent academic positions: 2016 – 7.4 months (variation 6-9 months) 2021 – 6 months (variation 4-10 months)</p>
4. Do we make (sufficient) use of e-recruitment tools?	x	x		<i>++ Yes, completely</i>	<p>NTNU has for years used an online recruitment system, which covers all stages of the process. Development ambitions include better integration of the e-systems for recruitment, HR administration, and archiving with a new case processing system to be implemented in 2023.</p>
5. Do we have a quality control system for OTM-R in place?	x	x	x	<i>++ Yes, completely</i>	<p>HR staff ensures that all cases are treated in conformity with the Staff regulations. OTM-R is embedded in Norwegian legislation to ensure that the best-qualified candidate is selected. A two-step process is applied for</p>

					<p>all academic positions separating the assessment of applicants (Department level) from the appointment decision (Faculty level).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Applicant satisfaction surveys have been conducted from 2020 to obtain systematic feedback from all applicants on the recruitment process.
6. Does our current OTM-R policy encourage external candidates to apply?	x	x	x	<i>++ Yes, completely</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ The trend in the share of applicants to academic positions from outside NTNU (Source: JobbNorge) 2017: 94 % of applicants from outside NTNU 2021: 96 % of applicants from outside NTNU (81 % of those employed were from outside NTNU)
7. Is our current OTM-R policy in line with policies to attract researchers from abroad?	x	x	x	<i>++ Yes, completely</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ The trend in the share of applicants to academic positions from abroad (non-Norwegian national) (Source: JobbNorge) 2017: 87 % non-Norwegian applicants 2021: 93 % non-Norwegian applicants (58 % of those employed were non-Norwegian)
8. Is our current OTM-R policy in line with policies to attract underrepresented groups?	x	x	x	<i>++ Yes, completely</i>	<p>NTNU job advertisement templates include clauses to encourage underrepresented groups to apply. NTNU staff regulations stipulate that if there are qualified applicants with an immigrant background or with a disability, at least one of them shall be invited for an interview. To enable moderate gender quotation, the nomination shall make it clear if the qualifications of applicants are approximately equivalent.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ The trend in the share of applicants among underrepresented groups (female applicants to academic positions) (Source: JobbNorge) 2017: 24 % female applicants 2021: 27 % female applicants (46 % of those employed were female. NTNU developments particularly focus on the recruitment of professors. In 2021, 1 of 5 new professors and 11 of 31 new associate professors were female)
9. Is our current OTM-R policy in line with policies to provide attractive working conditions for researchers?	x	x	x	<i>++ Yes, completely</i>	<p>NTNU HR Policy underlines that the university shall provide internationally competitive working conditions – academically and socially – to attract internationally</p>

					outstanding researchers and academic staff. NTNU International Researcher Support (Euraxess Service Centre) supports the Departments in their onboarding of international staff.
10. Do we have the means to monitor whether the most suitable researchers apply?				<i>-/+ Partially</i>	The Department/Research group will normally have an impression of whether they obtained the most suitable applicants on the job market.
Advertising and application phase					
11. Do we have clear guidelines or templates (e.g., EURAXESS) for advertising positions?	x	x		<i>++ Yes, completely</i>	Guidelines and templates for the recruitment process is part of the harmonized recruitment procedures and administrative tools mentioned under item 2 and 3. HR encourages “programmatically recruitment” selecting the most promising channels for advertisements and actively “searching for candidates” in relevant academic environments.
12. Do we include in the job advertisement references/links to all the elements foreseen in the relevant section of the toolkit?	x	x		<i>+/- Yes, substantially</i>	The <u>website for vacant positions</u> , guidelines, and templates for the recruitment process has in line with recommendations from the external evaluation in 2019 and the OTM-R toolkit, been improved to provide information about the recruitment process (including a YouTube about it) and information about working conditions at NTNU. Work is ongoing in 2022 to also provide better and more relevant information on competence and career development opportunities at NTNU.
13. Do we make full use of EURAXESS to ensure our research vacancies reach a wider audience?	x	x		<i>+/- Yes, substantially</i>	Advertisement on Euraxess Jobs is optional in the e-recruitment system unless it is an EU mobility grant position. Advertisements on Euraxess Jobs are, however, the default option in the e-recruitment system and all internationally published positions should be posted on the Euraxess Jobs portal. ➤ The share of job advertisements posted on EURAXESS). In 2017, 8 % of the 573 advertisements for academic positions were also posted on Euraxess

					Jobs. Most were PhD and Postdoc posts. In 2021, 100 % of the academic positions were announced on the Euraxess Jobs portal (lecturers, research lecturers, PhD and Postdoc posts, researchers, associate professor, and full professors).
14. Do we make use of other job advertising tools?	x	x		<i>++ Yes, completely</i>	Multiple channels are used among others uni jobs, researchgate, LinkedIn, but also selected journals and newspapers such as Nature or Die Zeit depending on the research field.
15. Do we keep the administrative burden to a minimum for the candidate?	x			<i>++ Yes, completely</i>	Documentation is limited to what is necessary for the assessment and can be uploaded on the e-application system. Original documents such as letters of recommendation can be requested at the interview. Certificates in the original language are accepted, but candidates are kindly requested to send a <u>Diploma Supplement</u> or a similar document describing the study and grade system.
Selection and evaluation phase					
16. Do we have clear rules governing the appointment of selection committees?		x	x	<i>++ Yes, completely</i>	NTNU Staff Regulations for academic positions: The expert committee and if applicable the committee on teaching skills are appointed by the Head of Department. The appointment authority is a subgroup of the Faculty Board.
17. Do we have clear rules concerning the composition of selection committees?		x	x	<i>++ Yes, completely</i>	NTNU Staff Regulations for academic positions: The expert committee shall have at least three members of which two external and of both genders. The teaching skills committee shall also have at least three members including a student and both genders.
18. Are the committees sufficiently gender-balanced?		x	x	<i>++ Yes, completely</i>	NTNU Staff Regulations for academic positions: Both genders must be represented on expert committees, teaching committees, and appointment authority.
19. Do we have clear guidelines for selection committees which help to judge 'merit' in a			x	<i>++ Yes, completely</i>	The required qualifications for various academic positions are defined in the national Regulations concerning appointment and promotion to teaching and

way that leads to the best candidate being selected?					<p>research posts (in conformity with Council Directive 89/48 EEC and Directive 2001/19/EC). For specific disciplines, supplementary qualifications guidelines are developed by the Disciplinary Strategic Units of Universities Norway (UHR).</p> <p>NTNU Staff Regulations stipulate that in the total assessment, the expert assessments shall be emphasized, but the assessment of teaching skills, interviews, and reference checks may provide the basis for changing the ranking or for not nominating an applicant.</p>
Appointment phase					
20. Do we inform all applicants at the end of the selection process?		x		++ Yes, completely	All applicants are informed about who got the job.
21. Do we provide adequate feedback to interviewees?		x		++ Yes, completely	All applicants receive the list of applicants. All applicants get feedback from the peer assessment committee. Those selected for interviews and trial lectures receive an academic assessment report from the expert committee and the teaching committee. Interviewees get feedback if they ask for it.
22. Do we have an appropriate complaints mechanism in place?		x		-/+ Yes, substantially	<p>Applicants are given a one-week period for comments on the expert committee's report (academic judgment and ranking of candidates).</p> <p>With respect to the total assessment and final appointment decision, national legislation does not permit insight into the reasons behind the hiring decision and does not open to complaints about the decision (<i>Public Administration Act</i>). However, if an applicant sends a complaint or contacts HR or the Department, the applicant will get appropriate feedback on factual and procedural matters.</p>
Overall assessment					
23. Do we have a system in place to assess whether OTM-R delivers on its objectives?				++ Yes, completely	The OTM-R objective of appointing the best-qualified candidate regardless of nationality or gender is firmly

					<p>embedded in the Norwegian Act relating to universities and university colleges and Regulations and local procedures for the recruitment of academic staff. Firm national and institutional regulations coupled with clear procedures and templates for assessment reports, and professional support from HR staff, contribute to high quality in each step of the recruitment process. The procedures include checkpoints to ensure impartiality in the composition of assessment committees and in the case handling process.</p>
--	--	--	--	--	---